



# 1948 Semi Final Saturday 28th August Cricket Ground



## Balmain 8

Dave PARKINSON  
 Arthur PATTON  
 George WILLIAMS  
 Tom BOURKE (c)  
 Leo NOSWORTHY  
 Bill SNEDDON  
 Des BRYAN  
 Jack HAMPSTEAD  
 Pat MADDEN  
 Sid RYAN  
 Jim THOMSON  
 Bob CRANE  
 Jack SPENCER

## def.

**Fullback**  
**Wing**  
**Centre**  
**Centre**  
**Wing**  
**Five-eighth**  
**Half**  
**Lock**  
**Second Row**  
**Second Row**  
**Front Row**  
**Hooker**  
**Front Row**

## Western Suburbs 7

Bill KEATO  
 Pat LEAL  
 Eric BENNETT  
 Lindsay RODDA  
 Col HUDSON  
 Frank STANMORE  
 Neville HOGAN  
 Peter McLEAN  
 Bernie PURCELL  
 Kevin HANSEN  
 Jack WALSH (c)  
 William BROWN  
 Bill HORDER



**Tries** Jack HAMPSTEAD  
 Jack SPENCER

Kevin HANSEN

**Goals** Tom BOURKE (1)

Bill KEATO (2)

### Match Description

**Western Suburbs:** Full-back: W Keato; three-quarters: C Hudson, L Rodda, E Bennett, P Leal; five-eighth: F Stanmore; half: N Hogan; forwards: P McLean, B Purcell, K Hansen, J Walsh (c), W Brown, W Horder

**Balmain:** Full-back: D Parkinson; three-quarters: A Patton, T Bourke (capt), G Williams, L Noseworthy; five-eighth: W Sneddon; half: D Bryan; forwards: J Hampstead, S Ryan, F Madden, J Spencer, R Crane, J Thomson **Referee: G Bishop (Rugby League News 4th September 1948)**

Disputes over touch judges' decisions marked yesterday's Ruby League semi-final at the SCG, in which Balmain beat Western Suburbs 8-7. Dissension was caused when - \* West's winger, Col Hudson, was ruled to have put his foot into touch, when he crossed after an 80-yards dash in the last few minutes. \*Referee Bishop ordered a line drop-out after Arthur Patton (Balmain) and Pat Leal (Wests) raced to a ball kicked over West's line.\* Touch judges disagreed in a kick at goal by Tom Bourke, Balmain captain, right in front, and Bishop ruled a goal. \*A Balmain kick which went into touch-in-goal but was ruled to have found the line infield. \*A Wests player claimed he had influenced a touch judge's decision on a goal-kick by Bourke, by calling "no goal" after the linesman had commenced to raise his flag, which was then lowered. However, Balmain would have been most unlucky to lose. It dominated the game for most of the time, and, but for consistently losing penalties near the opposing line, must have put the issue beyond doubt in the first half. Hudson claimed that touch judge Jack Davies erred in ruling him in touch after his stirring dash. Linesman Davies said after the game that he had no hesitation in raising his flag, as Hudson definitely stepped out. Balmain players were emphatic that Patton had scored a fair try by beating Pat Leal to the ball kicked over Wests' line. The closest touch judge was running around, apparently anticipating a kick at goal, when Bishop told him there was no try. The game was one of the best for several years, with Balmain again displaying its famed big-game form. Every player rose to the occasion and none has ever played better football. ... Keato had several chances to kick a winning goal in the final stages but could not raise the flags. ... A crowd of 25,907 watched the game. **(The Sun 29th August 1948)**

Wests claimed that linesman Davies' decision against Hudson had "robbed" them of a win. The players gesticulated angrily on the field, and joined officials in a heated discussion in the dressing-room after the match. The club's president (Mr. J. Neil) said: "A reputable spectator, who watched the match through field-glasses, said Hudson's foot did not go within six inches of the line." He said later that the linesman's decision was final, and his club could take no action. Linesman Davies claimed that Balmain full-back Dave Parkinson had forced Hudson into touch. **(The Daily Telegraph 29th August 1948)**

From the press-box it certainly looked as if Hudson had clearly and fairly scored, but the linesman, of course, is the final judge, and he let the Press know clearly when interviewed later. 'I gave my decision. You saw it. And that is all I have to say,' he said. Which was not very enlightening, especially as the try was disputed. The dressing-rooms of both teams buzzed with excitement when the players came off the field. Here is what Hudson himself said: 'I did not put my foot out on the touch line, nor did I touch the corner post. The linesman reckoned I ran out into touch. But I ran straight ahead, and nobody touched me until after I had touched the ball down to score. **(Truth 29th August 1948)**

.....

**Notes:** Similarly to 1947, this was a very controversial semi-final. Played on a heavy SCG with a big mud patch, Wests hammered the Balmain line for the final ten minutes but couldn't break through, although Col Hudson swore he scored the winning try. The linesman put up his flag for being in touch but most good judges seemed to agree that he hadn't gone near the line. Balmain also had a goal allowed after the Touch Judges were one up, one down. Peter McLean was a tower of strength in the forwards and Eric Bennett shone in the backs. Wests now went to the Grand Final Challenge.