



1908 Round 5 Saturday 23rd May RAS Showground



Newcastle 24

def.

Western Suburbs 2

George PRICE
 Artie COLEMAN
 Ted McGUINNESS
 W ROBINSON
 William BAILEY
 R LAWSON
 George COX
 A NICHOLSON
 George HARDY
 William DOYLE
 Sam CARPENTER (c)
 Charlie CROFT
 Les CARPENTER

Fullback
Wing
Centre
Centre
Wing
Five-Eighth
Halfback
Lock
Second Row
Second Row
Front Row
Hooker
Front Row

Arthur BROWN
 Claude McFAYDEN
 Harold BOYLE
 Raymond GORMLEY
 Percy FRANKS
 Edward ELLIS
 Ted DUGGAN
 Ted MEAD
 William ELLIOTT
 Robert ELLIS
 Alfred MOUNT
 Jim STACK (c)
 Jim ABERCROMBIE



Tries

William BAILEY
 Les CARPENTER
 Artie COLEMAN
 Charlie CROFT
 William DOYLE
 R LAWSON

Goals

Stan CARPENTER (3)

Jim ABERCROMBIE (1)

Match Description

Western Suburbs: A. Brown, fullback; Doyle, B Duggan, C McFadden, P Franks, three-quarters; R Gormley and E Ellis halves; J Abercrombie, T Mount, E Mead, J Stack (c), R Ellis, W Elliott, forwards

Newcastle: G Price, fullback; W Bailey, E McGuinness, A Coleman, Robinson three-quarters; G Cox and R Lawson halves; Hardy, Nicholson, Doyle, R Croft, S Carpenter and L Carpenter, forwards. **Mr Arthur Welsh, Referee**

Carpenter kicked off for Newcastle and play at once became fast with the ball travelling from one end of the field to the other. Play at this stage was hardly up to first grade standard, both teams being at fault. Carpenter, off-side, was penalised and Abercrombie kicked a goal from an easy position. Western Suburbs 2 points to nil. In play again, Abercrombie, the Western Suburbs forward, proved too heavy for the ball, with the result that it burst, and operations were suspended pending the arrival of a new one. Soon after resuming, Newcastle were penalised for off-side, and Western Suburbs failed at goal. The W.S. three-quarters now participated in a good passing bout, but Newcastle saved with a fine tackle. Half time Western Suburbs 2 points to nil. Abercrombie kicked off on resuming and play was taken to the Western Suburbs' 25. The suburban men were here penalised and S Carpenter failed at goal. Newcastle next rushed the ball over the line, but lost it when a try seemed certain. Almost at once Newcastle again rushed it over and Croft scored the first try. S Carpenter made no mistake with the kick. Newcastle 5 to 2. Western Suburbs now became demoralised and Newcastle again scored, through the agency of Doyle. McGuinness failed at goal. Newcastle 8 to 2. Some good following up saw the Western fullback beaten in trying to force and Lawson scored a try, from which S Carpenter kicked a goal. Newcastle 13 to 2. Almost at once the Western Suburbs fullback was again caught napping and L Carpenter scored a try. S Carpenter kicking the goal. Newcastle 18 to 2. Western Suburbs' exhibition was so very poor that the play became farcical. The scoring so far was not accomplished by any brilliant play by Newcastle. At this stage a Western Suburbs player was ordered off the field for alleged striking at an opponent. From a scrummage, Doyle passed to Coleman, who scored another try, but Price failed at goal. Newcastle 21 to 8. In play again, Bailey secured and, beating all opponents, added still another try. Price failed at goal. Newcastle 24 to 2. **(Sunday Times 24th May 1908)**

Another slight delay occurred through Boyle colliding with two Newcastle men and he was carried off the field **(SMH 25th May 1908)**

.....

Notes: Jim Abercrombie fell on the ball and burst it and the first ever Wests' player was sent off but wasn't named. There are conflicting records as to who played in the backs for Wests in this game. Some records have William Doyle, the Newcastle player being carried off after a collision but the Sunday Sun, SMH, and Australian Star clearly identify a **Wests man** carried off. Here is where the mysterious Boyleau appears in the records. He was supposed to have played one match for Wests, has Medal no. 103 as a first-grade player from the NRL and appears in one team list (Sunday Sun). However, no other papers mentioned him and the back was listed as Doyle (hence the confusion), Boyldan and Boyle. The player carried off was mentioned as Boyleau, Doyle and Boyle. One paper had Tom Phelan playing but no others. In Reserve Grade H Doyle (who played regularly in 2nds and played two first grade matches in 1909) played the previous week and the following week but not on the 23rd May. Tom Phelan was also singled out in the following match in most reports, playing at full-back, replacing Arthur Brown, who obviously had a shocker. The Referee comment is telling where it says that "...Phelan was a great **addition** to the team at fullback. Phelan also didn't play another match after this in 1908 so may have been carrying an injury, although he was also becoming heavily involved in administration. It seems highly likely that it was **James Harold Boyle** who took Phelan's place in this match and there is no such player as Boyleau (also no birth records at all for that surname).