



1910 Round 1 Saturday 30th April RAS Showground



Eastern Suburbs 24

def.

Western Suburbs 14

Bill KING
 C NASH
 Herbert MESSENGER (c)
 Lesley WYLIE
 Tom BRUCE
 H KAUFMAN
 Bernard DALTON
 Johnno STUNTZ
 Bob MABLE
 Robert WILLIAMS
 George GREEN
 Mick FRAWLEY
 Percy WHITE
 Eddie GRIFFITHS

Fullback
Wing
Centre
Centre
Wing
Five-eighth
Half
Lock
Second Row
Second Row
Front Row
Hooker
Front Row
Reserve

Bill MEDCALF
 Ernest WELLING
 Claude McFAYDEN
 Frank FEENEY
 Henry NAYLOR
 Percy BOLT
 William MANTLE
 Tom DOYLE
 Verner JARVIS
 Wal BARCLAY
 Jim ABERCROMBIE (c)
 Ernest PALMER
 Jim STACK



Tries

Mick FRAWLEY (2)
 Herbert MESSENGER (2)
 Percy WHITE
 Lesley WYLIE

Jim STACK
 Tom DOYLE

Goals

Herbert MESSENGER (3)

Bill MEDCALF (4)

Match Description

Eastern Suburbs: Full-back, King; three-quarters, Nash, Messenger, Wilie, Bruce; half-backs; Kaufman, Dalton; forwards; White, Frawley, Green, Williams, Noble, Stuntz.

Western Suburbs: Full-back, Medcalf; three-quarters, Wellings, Fenney, McFayden, Naylor; half-backs, Bolt. Mantle; forwards, Doyle, Jarvis, Barclay, Abercrombie, Palmer, Stack **Referee. Mr. H. M. Poulton.**

About 500 persons were present when Messenger kicked off for Eastern Suburbs. Nash had his shoulder hurt, and retired, Griffiths taking his place. Messenger secured, and passing back to Wylie, back to Messenger, who scored. Messenger failed at goal Eastern Suburbs 13; Western Suburbs 2. Easts were again penalised and Medcalf kicked a goal. Eastern Suburbs 13; Western Suburbs 4. These were the half-time scores. Soon after the interval Stuntz sent to Messenger, who scored in the corner. King failed to convert. Eastern Suburbs 16; Western Suburbs 4. Wests were awarded a free kick, but Medcalf failed at goal. Williams picked up near the centre, and passed to Willie, who ran in unopposed. Messenger's kick at goal failed. Eastern Suburbs 19; Western Suburbs 4. Naylor picked up midfield and passed to **Stack**, who scored. Medcalf converted. Eastern Suburbs 19; Western Suburbs 9. Frawley received a high pass from Dalton in West's 25, and scored.. Messenger kicked an easy goal. Eastern Suburbs 24; Western Suburbs 9. One of the West's men kicked the ball between the posts and Dingle racing down scored. Medcalf kicked an easy goal. Eastern Suburbs 24; Western Suburbs 14. These were the final scores. **(Evening News 30th April 1910)**

Notes: There are discrepancies in the various news reports that are difficult to reconcile. Two papers (Evening News and Sunday Times) had Jim Stack in the team and both had Stack scoring a try. Another two (SMH and Sydney Mail) had Owens, not Stack, in the team. and Sydney Morning Herald had Owens scoring a try in the same way as Stack. Remember, Stack did not play in 1909 and did not play another game until Rounds 13 & 14 in 1910 and A. Owens played in Round 2 and 3, 1910. A major consideration is that in 1908 when both Stack and Abercrombie played, in the first eight matches Stack was captain and it is only in the 9th game, when Stack didn't play, Abercrombie was named captain. In this game Abercrombie was captain, while in the two games Stack played (Rds 13 & 14) he was captain. However, Stack is found to be playing 2nd Grade matches in Rounds 4-11. He is also mentioned as being one of the best forwards on the field in The Arrow. Similarly, only one newspaper report (The Sunday Sun 1st May 1910) has Tom Doyle scoring the second try (as recorded in other official records). The Evening News has Dingle? scoring (most probably meaning Doyle) but the SMH, Mail and Sportsman all had Naylor scoring off a Tom Bruce error. It seems after all analysis that the best proposition is that Jim Stack played, scored a try, but was most probably injured, came back to 2nd Grade and took a long time to get back to Firsts. Tom Doyle appears to be the try scorer. A later Sportsman report said "What is wrong with Western Suburbs?in their practice games they gave promise of being a very strong side, and with the **country additions** it was expected they would be strong enough to give the rest a good go for it." (Sportsman 21st May 1910). The country additions were Henry Naylor, Percy Bolt (often called "Nutsy" in the Sportsman), Tom Doyle, Ernest Palmer and William "Pummy" Mantle, all from Lithgow. Their journey to Western Suburbs and later in their contribution in WW1 is brilliantly outlined in a recommended book, *Side Stepping Shrapnel* by Peter Baker. Henry Naylor became a real star and in many reports was often cited as the best player on the field. He had some representative honours but was the understudy for Chris McKivat, the superstar for Glebe and the Kangaroos. Medcalf had now established himself as the fullback. Frank Feeney, often confused with Jasper Feeney, who was playing in Queensland at the time, debuted.